

# Voronovskaya type asymptotic expansions for error function based quasi-interpolation neural network operators

George A. Anastassiou  
Department of Mathematical Sciences  
University of Memphis  
Memphis, TN 38152, U.S.A.  
ganastss@memphis.edu

## Abstract

Here we examine further the quasi-interpolation error function based neural network operators of one hidden layer. Based on fractional calculus theory we derive a fractional Voronovskaya type asymptotic expansion for the error of approximation of these operators the unit operator studying the univariate case. We treat also analogously the multivariate case.

**2010 AMS Mathematics Subject Classification:** 26A33, 41A25, 41A36, 41A60.

**Keywords and Phrases:** Neural Network Fractional Approximation, Multivariate Neural Network Approximation, Voronovskaya Asymptotic Expansions, fractional derivative, error function.

## 1 Background

We consider here the (Gauss) error special function ([1], [17])

$$\operatorname{erf}(x) = \frac{2}{\sqrt{\pi}} \int_0^x e^{-t^2} dt, \quad x \in \mathbb{R}, \quad (1)$$

which is a sigmoidal type function and a strictly increasing function.

It has the basic properties

$$\operatorname{erf}(0) = 0, \quad \operatorname{erf}(-x) = -\operatorname{erf}(x), \quad \operatorname{erf}(+\infty) = 1, \quad \operatorname{erf}(-\infty) = -1.$$

We consider the activation function ([15])

$$\chi(x) = \frac{1}{4} (\operatorname{erf}(x+1) - \operatorname{erf}(x-1)), \quad \text{any } x \in \mathbb{R}, \quad (2)$$

which is an even positive function.

Next we follow [15] on  $\chi$ . We got there  $\chi(0) \simeq 0.4215$ , and that  $\chi$  is strictly decreasing on  $[0, \infty)$  and strictly increasing on  $(-\infty, 0]$ , and the  $x$ -axis is the horizontal asymptote on  $\chi$ , i.e.  $\chi$  is a bell symmetric function.

**Theorem 1** ([15]) *We have that*

$$\sum_{i=-\infty}^{\infty} \chi(x-i) = 1, \quad \text{all } x \in \mathbb{R}, \quad (3)$$

$$\sum_{i=-\infty}^{\infty} \chi(nx-i) = 1, \quad \text{all } x \in \mathbb{R}, \quad n \in \mathbb{N}, \quad (4)$$

and

$$\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \chi(x) dx = 1, \quad (5)$$

that is  $\chi(x)$  is a density function on  $\mathbb{R}$ .

We need the important

**Theorem 2** ([15]) *Let  $0 < \alpha < 1$ , and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  with  $n^{1-\alpha} \geq 3$ . It holds*

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} \chi(nx-k) < \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi}(n^{1-\alpha}-2)e^{(n^{1-\alpha}-2)^2}} \\ : |nx-k| \geq n^{1-\alpha} \end{array} \right. \quad (6)$$

Denote by  $[\cdot]$  the integral part of the number and by  $\lceil \cdot \rceil$  the ceiling of the number.

**Theorem 3** ([15]) *Let  $x \in [a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  so that  $\lceil na \rceil \leq \lfloor nb \rfloor$ . It holds*

$$\frac{1}{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k)} < \frac{1}{\chi(1)} \simeq 4.019, \quad \forall x \in [a, b]. \quad (7)$$

Also from [15] we get

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \neq 1, \quad (8)$$

at least for some  $x \in [a, b]$ .

For large enough  $n$  we always obtain  $\lceil na \rceil \leq \lfloor nb \rfloor$ . Also  $a \leq \frac{k}{n} \leq b$ , iff  $\lceil na \rceil \leq k \leq \lfloor nb \rfloor$ . In general it holds by (4) that

$$\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \leq 1. \quad (9)$$

We need the univariate neural network operator

**Definition 4** ([15]) Let  $f \in C([a, b])$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ . We set

$$A_n(f, x) := \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \chi(nx - k)}{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k)}, \quad \forall x \in [a, b], \quad (10)$$

$A_n$  is a univariate neural network operator.

Notice here  $0 < \alpha < 1$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  with  $n^{1-\alpha} \geq 3$ . Let the fixed  $K, L > 0$ ; for the linear combination  $\frac{K}{n^\alpha} + \frac{L}{(n^{1-\alpha}-2)e^{(n^{1-\alpha}-2)^2}}$ , the dominant rate of convergence to zero, as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , is  $n^{-\alpha}$ . The closer  $\alpha$  is to 1, we get faster and better rate of convergence to zero.

We mention from [16] the following:

We define

$$Z(x_1, \dots, x_N) := Z(x) := \prod_{i=1}^N \chi(x_i), \quad x = (x_1, \dots, x_N) \in \mathbb{R}^N, \quad N \in \mathbb{N}. \quad (11)$$

It has the properties:

(i)  $Z(x) > 0, \quad \forall x \in \mathbb{R}^N,$

(ii)

$$\sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} Z(x - k) := \sum_{k_1=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{k_2=-\infty}^{\infty} \dots \sum_{k_N=-\infty}^{\infty} Z(x_1 - k_1, \dots, x_N - k_N) = 1, \quad (12)$$

where  $k := (k_1, \dots, k_N) \in \mathbb{Z}^N, \quad \forall x \in \mathbb{R}^N,$

hence

(iii)

$$\begin{aligned} & \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} Z(nx - k) := \\ & \sum_{k_1=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{k_2=-\infty}^{\infty} \dots \sum_{k_N=-\infty}^{\infty} Z(nx_1 - k_1, \dots, nx_N - k_N) = 1, \end{aligned} \quad (13)$$

$\forall x \in \mathbb{R}^N; \quad n \in \mathbb{N},$

and

(iv)

$$\int_{\mathbb{R}^N} Z(x) dx = 1, \quad (14)$$

that is  $Z$  is a multivariate density function.

Here  $\|x\|_\infty := \max\{|x_1|, \dots, |x_N|\}$ ,  $x \in \mathbb{R}^N$ , also set  $\infty := (\infty, \dots, \infty)$ ,  $-\infty := (-\infty, \dots, -\infty)$  upon the multivariate context, and

$$\begin{aligned} \lceil na \rceil &:= (\lceil na_1 \rceil, \dots, \lceil na_N \rceil), \\ \lfloor nb \rfloor &:= (\lfloor nb_1 \rfloor, \dots, \lfloor nb_N \rfloor), \end{aligned} \quad (15)$$

where  $a := (a_1, \dots, a_N)$ ,  $b := (b_1, \dots, b_N)$ .

We obviously see that

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) &= \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \chi(nx_i - k_i) \right) = \\ \sum_{k_1=\lceil na_1 \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_1 \rfloor} \dots \sum_{k_N=\lceil na_N \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_N \rfloor} \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \chi(nx_i - k_i) \right) &= \prod_{i=1}^N \left( \sum_{k_i=\lceil na_i \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_i \rfloor} \chi(nx_i - k_i) \right). \end{aligned} \quad (16)$$

For  $0 < \beta < 1$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , a fixed  $x \in \mathbb{R}^N$ , we have that

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k) &= \\ \sum_{\substack{k=\lceil na \rceil \\ \|\frac{k}{n} - x\|_\infty \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k) + \sum_{\substack{k=\lceil na \rceil \\ \|\frac{k}{n} - x\|_\infty > \frac{1}{n^\beta}}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k). \end{aligned} \quad (17)$$

In the last two sums the counting is over disjoint vector sets of  $k$ 's, because the condition  $\|\frac{k}{n} - x\|_\infty > \frac{1}{n^\beta}$  implies that there exists at least one  $|\frac{k_r}{n} - x_r| > \frac{1}{n^\beta}$ , where  $r \in \{1, \dots, N\}$ .

From [16] we need

$$\begin{aligned} \text{(v)} \quad \sum_{\substack{k=\lceil na \rceil \\ \|\frac{k}{n} - x\|_\infty > \frac{1}{n^\beta}}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) &\leq \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta} - 2)^2}}, \end{aligned} \quad (18)$$

$$0 < \beta < 1, n \in \mathbb{N}; n^{1-\beta} \geq 3, x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right),$$

$$\text{(vi)} \quad 0 < \frac{1}{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k)} < \frac{1}{(\chi(1))^N} \simeq (4.019)^N, \quad (19)$$

$$\forall x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right), n \in \mathbb{N},$$

and

$$(vii) \quad \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} Z(nx-k) \leq \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi}(n^{1-\beta}-2)e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}}, \quad (20)$$

$$\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k=-\infty \\ \left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} > \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \end{array} \right.$$

$$0 < \beta < 1, n \in \mathbb{N} : n^{1-\beta} \geq 3, x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right).$$

Also we get that

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx-k) \neq 1, \quad (21)$$

for at least some  $x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$ .

Let  $f \in C \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$  and  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $\lceil na_i \rceil \leq \lfloor nb_i \rfloor$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, N$ .

We mention from [16] the multivariate positive linear neural network operator  $(x := (x_1, \dots, x_N) \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right))$

$$H_n(f, x_1, \dots, x_N) := H_n(f, x) := \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) Z(nx-k)}{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx-k)} \quad (22)$$

$$:= \frac{\sum_{k_1=\lceil na_1 \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_1 \rfloor} \sum_{k_2=\lceil na_2 \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_2 \rfloor} \dots \sum_{k_N=\lceil na_N \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_N \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k_1}{n}, \dots, \frac{k_N}{n}\right) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \chi(nx_i - k_i) \right)}{\prod_{i=1}^N \left( \sum_{k_i=\lceil na_i \rceil}^{\lfloor nb_i \rfloor} \chi(nx_i - k_i) \right)}.$$

For large enough  $n$  we always obtain  $\lceil na_i \rceil \leq \lfloor nb_i \rfloor$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, N$ . Also  $a_i \leq \frac{k_i}{n} \leq b_i$ , iff  $\lceil na_i \rceil \leq k_i \leq \lfloor nb_i \rfloor$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, N$ .

Let fixed  $j \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $0 < \beta < 1$ , and  $A, B > 0$ . For large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N} : n^{1-\beta} \geq 3$ , in the linear combination  $\left( \frac{A}{n^{\beta j}} + \frac{B}{(n^{1-\beta}-2)e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}} \right)$ , the dominant rate of convergence, as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , is  $n^{-\beta j}$ . The closer  $\beta$  is to 1 we get faster and better rate of convergence to zero.

By  $AC^m \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$ ,  $m, N \in \mathbb{N}$ , we denote the space of functions such that all partial derivatives of order  $(m-1)$  are coordinatewise absolutely continuous functions, also  $f \in C^{m-1} \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$ .

Let  $f \in AC^m \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$ ,  $m, N \in \mathbb{N}$ . Here  $f_{\alpha}$  denotes a partial derivative of  $f$ ,  $\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N)$ ,  $\alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, N$ , and  $|\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = l$ , where  $l = 0, 1, \dots, m$ . We write also  $f_{\alpha} := \frac{\partial^{\alpha} f}{\partial x^{\alpha}}$  and we say it is order  $l$ .

We denote

$$\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} := \max_{|\alpha|=m} \{\|f_\alpha\|_\infty\}, \quad (23)$$

where  $\|\cdot\|_\infty$  is the supremum norm.

We assume here that  $\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} < \infty$ .

We need

**Definition 5** Let  $\nu > 0$ ,  $n = \lceil \nu \rceil$  ( $\lceil \cdot \rceil$  is the ceiling of the number),  $f \in AC^n([a, b])$  (space of functions  $f$  with  $f^{(n-1)} \in AC([a, b])$ , absolutely continuous functions). We call left Caputo fractional derivative (see [21], pp. 49-52) the function

$$D_{*a}^\nu f(x) = \frac{1}{\Gamma(n-\nu)} \int_a^x (x-t)^{n-\nu-1} f^{(n)}(t) dt, \quad (24)$$

$\forall x \in [a, b]$ , where  $\Gamma$  is the gamma function  $\Gamma(\nu) = \int_0^\infty e^{-t} t^{\nu-1} dt$ ,  $\nu > 0$ . Notice  $D_{*a}^\nu f \in L_1([a, b])$  and  $D_{*a}^\nu f$  exists a.e. on  $[a, b]$ .

We set  $D_{*a}^0 f(x) = f(x)$ ,  $\forall x \in [a, b]$ .

**Definition 6** (see also [4], [22], [23]). Let  $f \in AC^m([a, b])$ ,  $m = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $\alpha > 0$ . The right Caputo fractional derivative of order  $\alpha > 0$  is given by

$$D_{b-}^\alpha f(x) = \frac{(-1)^m}{\Gamma(m-\alpha)} \int_x^b (\zeta-x)^{m-\alpha-1} f^{(m)}(\zeta) d\zeta, \quad (25)$$

$\forall x \in [a, b]$ . We set  $D_{b-}^0 f(x) = f(x)$ . Notice  $D_{b-}^\alpha f \in L_1([a, b])$  and  $D_{b-}^\alpha f$  exists a.e. on  $[a, b]$ .

**Convention 7** We assume that

$$D_{*x_0}^\alpha f(x) = 0, \quad \text{for } x < x_0, \quad (26)$$

and

$$D_{x_0-}^\alpha f(x) = 0, \quad \text{for } x > x_0, \quad (27)$$

for all  $x, x_0 \in (a, b]$ .

We mention

**Proposition 8** (by [6]) Let  $f \in C^n([a, b])$ ,  $n = \lceil \nu \rceil$ ,  $\nu > 0$ . Then  $D_{*a}^\nu f(x)$  is continuous in  $x \in [a, b]$ .

Also we have

**Proposition 9** (by [6]) Let  $f \in C^m([a, b])$ ,  $m = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $\alpha > 0$ . Then  $D_{b-}^\alpha f(x)$  is continuous in  $x \in [a, b]$ .

**Theorem 10** ([6]) Let  $f \in C^m([a, b])$ ,  $m = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $\alpha > 0$ ,  $x, x_0 \in [a, b]$ . Then  $D_{*x_0}^\alpha f(x)$ ,  $D_{x_0-}^\alpha f(x)$  are jointly continuous functions in  $(x, x_0)$  from  $[a, b]^2$  into  $\mathbb{R}$ .

We mention the left Caputo fractional Taylor formula with integral remainder.

**Theorem 11** ([21], p. 54) Let  $f \in AC^m([a, b])$ ,  $[a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$ ,  $m = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $\alpha > 0$ . Then

$$f(x) = \sum_{k=0}^{m-1} \frac{f^{(k)}(x_0)}{k!} (x - x_0)^k + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_{x_0}^x (x - J)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x_0}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \quad (28)$$

$\forall x \geq x_0; x, x_0 \in [a, b]$ .

Also we mention the right Caputo fractional Taylor formula.

**Theorem 12** ([4]) Let  $f \in AC^m([a, b])$ ,  $[a, b] \subset \mathbb{R}$ ,  $m = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $\alpha > 0$ . Then

$$f(x) = \sum_{j=0}^{m-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x_0)}{j!} (x - x_0)^j + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_x^{x_0} (J - x)^{\alpha-1} D_{x_0-}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \quad (29)$$

$\forall x \leq x_0; x, x_0 \in [a, b]$ .

For more on fractional calculus related to this work see [3], [5] and [8].

Next we follow [9], pp. 284-286.

#### **About Taylor formula -Multivariate Case and Estimates**

Let  $Q$  be a compact convex subset of  $\mathbb{R}^N$ ;  $N \geq 2$ ;  $z := (z_1, \dots, z_N)$ ,  $x_0 := (x_{01}, \dots, x_{0N}) \in Q$ .

Let  $f : Q \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  be such that all partial derivatives of order  $(m-1)$  are coordinatewise absolutely continuous functions,  $m \in \mathbb{N}$ . Also  $f \in C^{m-1}(Q)$ . That is  $f \in AC^m(Q)$ . Each  $m^{\text{th}}$  order partial derivative is denoted by  $f_\alpha := \frac{\partial^\alpha f}{\partial x^\alpha}$ , where  $\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N)$ ,  $\alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, N$  and  $|\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = m$ . Consider  $g_z(t) := f(x_0 + t(z - x_0))$ ,  $t \geq 0$ . Then

$$g_z^{(j)}(t) = \left[ \left( \sum_{i=1}^N (z_i - x_{0i}) \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \right)^j f \right] (x_{01} + t(z_1 - x_{01}), \dots, x_{0N} + t(z_N - x_{0N})), \quad (30)$$

for all  $j = 0, 1, 2, \dots, m$ .

**Example 13** Let  $m = N = 2$ . Then

$$g_z(t) = f(x_{01} + t(z_1 - x_{01}), x_{02} + t(z_2 - x_{02})), \quad t \in \mathbb{R},$$

and

$$g'_z(t) = (z_1 - x_{01}) \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_1}(x_0 + t(z - x_0)) + (z_2 - x_{02}) \frac{\partial f}{\partial x_2}(x_0 + t(z - x_0)). \quad (31)$$

Setting

$$(*) = (x_{01} + t(z_1 - x_{01}), x_{02} + t(z_2 - x_{02})) = (x_0 + t(z - x_0)),$$

we get

$$\begin{aligned} g''_z(t) &= (z_1 - x_{01})^2 \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_1^2}(*) + (z_1 - x_{01})(z_2 - x_{02}) \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_2 \partial x_1}(*) + \\ &\quad (z_1 - x_{01})(z_2 - x_{02}) \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_1 \partial x_2}(*) + (z_2 - x_{02})^2 \frac{\partial^2 f}{\partial x_2^2}(*). \end{aligned} \quad (32)$$

Similarly, we have the general case of  $m, N \in \mathbb{N}$  for  $g_z^{(m)}(t)$ .

We mention the following multivariate Taylor theorem.

**Theorem 14** ([9]) *Under the above assumptions we have*

$$f(z_1, \dots, z_N) = g_z(1) = \sum_{j=0}^{m-1} \frac{g_z^{(j)}(0)}{j!} + R_m(z, 0), \quad (33)$$

where

$$R_m(z, 0) := \int_0^1 \left( \int_0^{t_1} \dots \left( \int_0^{t_{m-1}} g_z^{(m)}(t_m) dt_m \right) \dots \right) dt_1, \quad (34)$$

or

$$R_m(z, 0) = \frac{1}{(m-1)!} \int_0^1 (1-\theta)^{m-1} g_z^{(m)}(\theta) d\theta. \quad (35)$$

Notice that  $g_z(0) = f(x_0)$ .

We make

**Remark 15** *Assume here that*

$$\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, Q, m}^{\max} := \max_{|\alpha|=m} \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, Q} < \infty.$$

Then

$$\begin{aligned} \|g_z^{(m)}\|_{\infty, [0,1]} &= \left\| \left[ \left( \sum_{i=1}^N (z_i - x_{0i}) \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \right)^m f \right] (x_0 + t(z - x_0)) \right\|_{\infty, [0,1]} \leq \\ &\quad \left( \sum_{i=1}^N |z_i - x_{0i}| \right)^m \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, Q, m}^{\max}, \end{aligned} \quad (36)$$



that is

$$\left\| g_z^{(m)} \right\|_{\infty, [0,1]} \leq (\|z - x_0\|_{l_1})^m \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, Q, m}^{\max} < \infty. \quad (37)$$

Hence we get by (35) that

$$|R_m(z, 0)| \leq \frac{\left\| g_z^{(m)} \right\|_{\infty, [0,1]}}{m!} < \infty. \quad (38)$$

And it holds

$$|R_m(z, 0)| \leq \frac{(\|z - x_0\|_{l_1})^m}{m!} \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, Q, m}^{\max}, \quad (39)$$

$\forall z, x_0 \in Q$ .

Inequality (39) will be an important tool in proving our multivariate main result.

In this article first we find fractional Voronskaya type asymptotic expansion for  $A_n(f, x)$ ,  $x \in [a, b]$ , then we find multivariate Voronskaya type asymptotic expansion for  $H_n(f, x)$ ,  $x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$ ;  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

Our considered neural networks here are of one hidden layer.

For other neural networks related work, see [2], [7], [10], [11], [12], [13], [14], [18], [19], [20]. For neural networks in general, read [24], [25] and [26].

## 2 Main Results

We present our first univariate main result

**Theorem 16** *Let  $\alpha > 0$ ,  $N \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $N = \lceil \alpha \rceil$ ,  $f \in AC^N([a, b])$ ,  $0 < \beta < 1$ ,  $x \in [a, b]$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  large enough and  $n^{1-\beta} \geq 3$ . Assume that  $\|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]}$ ,  $\|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \leq M$ ,  $M > 0$ . Then*

$$A_n(f, x) - f(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} A_n\left((\cdot - x)^j\right)(x) + o\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(\alpha-\varepsilon)}}\right), \quad (40)$$

where  $0 < \varepsilon \leq \alpha$ .

If  $N = 1$ , the sum in (40) collapses.

The last (40) implies that

$$n^{\beta(\alpha-\varepsilon)} \left[ A_n(f, x) - f(x) - \sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} A_n\left((\cdot - x)^j\right)(x) \right] \rightarrow 0, \quad (41)$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $0 < \varepsilon \leq \alpha$ .

When  $N = 1$ , or  $f^{(j)}(x) = 0$ ,  $j = 1, \dots, N - 1$ , then we derive that

$$n^{\beta(\alpha-\varepsilon)} [A_n(f, x) - f(x)] \rightarrow 0$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $0 < \varepsilon \leq \alpha$ . Of great interest is the case of  $\alpha = \frac{1}{2}$ .

**Proof.** From [21], p. 54; (28), we get by the left Caputo fractional Taylor formula that

$$f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) = \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left(\frac{k}{n} - J\right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \quad (42)$$

for all  $x \leq \frac{k}{n} \leq b$ .

Also from [4]; (29), using the right Caputo fractional Taylor formula we get

$$f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) = \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left(J - \frac{k}{n}\right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \quad (43)$$

for all  $a \leq \frac{k}{n} \leq x$ .

We call

$$W(x) := \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k). \quad (44)$$

Hence we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} &= \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \frac{\chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \\ &\frac{\chi(nx - k)}{W(x) \Gamma(\alpha)} \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left(\frac{k}{n} - J\right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \end{aligned} \quad (45)$$

all  $x \leq \frac{k}{n} \leq b$ , iff  $\lceil nx \rceil \leq k \leq \lfloor nb \rfloor$ , and

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} &= \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \frac{\chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \\ &\frac{\chi(nx - k)}{W(x) \Gamma(\alpha)} \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left(J - \frac{k}{n}\right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ, \end{aligned} \quad (46)$$

for all  $a \leq \frac{k}{n} \leq x$ , iff  $\lceil na \rceil \leq k \leq \lfloor nx \rfloor$ .

We have that  $\lceil nx \rceil \leq \lfloor nx \rfloor + 1$ .

Therefore it holds

$$\sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \frac{f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} = \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \frac{\chi(nx - k) \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j}{W(x)} + \quad (47)$$

$$\frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \frac{\sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right),$$

and

$$\sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \frac{\chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} = \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \frac{\chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \quad (48)$$

$$\frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \frac{\chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right).$$

Adding the last two equalities (47) and (48) we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} A_n(f, x) &= \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) \frac{\chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} = \quad (49) \\ &= \sum_{j=0}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \frac{\chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)^j + \\ &= \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha) W(x)} \left\{ \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ + \right. \\ &\quad \left. \sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} (D_{*x}^\alpha f(J)) dJ \right\}. \end{aligned}$$

So we have derived

$$\theta(x) := A_n(f, x) - f(x) - \sum_{j=1}^{N-1} \frac{f^{(j)}(x)}{j!} A_n((\cdot - x)^j)(x) = \theta_n^*(x), \quad (50)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} \theta_n^*(x) &:= \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha) W(x)} \left\{ \sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right. \\ &\quad \left. + \sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k) \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right\}. \quad (51) \end{aligned}$$

We set

$$\theta_{1n}^*(x) := \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \frac{\sum_{k=\lfloor na \rfloor}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right), \quad (52)$$

and

$$\theta_{2n}^* := \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil nx \rceil+1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right), \quad (53)$$

i.e.

$$\theta_n^*(x) = \theta_{1n}^*(x) + \theta_{2n}^*(x). \quad (54)$$

We assume  $b-a > \frac{1}{n^\beta}$ ,  $0 < \beta < 1$ , which is always the case for large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ , that is when  $n > \left[ (b-a)^{-\frac{1}{\beta}} \right]$ . It is always true that either  $|\frac{k}{n} - x| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}$  or  $|\frac{k}{n} - x| > \frac{1}{n^\beta}$ .

For  $k = \lceil na \rceil, \dots, \lfloor nx \rfloor$ , we consider

$$\gamma_{1k} := \left| \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{x-}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right| \leq \quad (55)$$

$$\begin{aligned} & \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} |D_{x-}^\alpha f(J)| dJ \\ & \leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{(x - \frac{k}{n})^\alpha}{\alpha} \leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{(x-a)^\alpha}{\alpha}. \end{aligned} \quad (56)$$

That is

$$\gamma_{1k} \leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{(x-a)^\alpha}{\alpha}, \quad (57)$$

for  $k = \lceil na \rceil, \dots, \lfloor nx \rfloor$ .

Also we have in case of  $|\frac{k}{n} - x| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}$  that

$$\gamma_{1k} \leq \int_{\frac{k}{n}}^x \left( J - \frac{k}{n} \right)^{\alpha-1} |D_{x-}^\alpha f(J)| dJ \quad (58)$$

$$\leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{(x - \frac{k}{n})^\alpha}{\alpha} \leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}\alpha}.$$

So that, when  $(x - \frac{k}{n}) \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}$ , we get

$$\gamma_{1k} \leq \|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{1}{\alpha n^{\alpha\beta}}. \quad (59)$$

Therefore

$$|\theta_{1n}^*(x)| \leq \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nx \rfloor} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \gamma_{1k} \right) = \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)}.$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \left\{ \frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = [na] \\ : \left| \frac{k}{n} - x \right| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta} \end{array} \right\}}^{[nx]} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \gamma_{1k} + \frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = [na] \\ : \left| \frac{k}{n} - x \right| > \frac{1}{n^\beta} \end{array} \right\}}^{[nx]} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \gamma_{1k} \right\} \\
& \leq \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left\{ \left( \frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = [na] \\ : \left| \frac{k}{n} - x \right| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta} \end{array} \right\}}^{[nx]} \chi(nx-k)}{W(x)} \right) \|D_{x-f}^\alpha\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{1}{\alpha n^{\alpha\beta}} + \right. \\
& \left. \frac{1}{W(x)} \left( \sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = [na] \\ : \left| \frac{k}{n} - x \right| > \frac{1}{n^\beta} \end{array} \right\}}^{[nx]} \chi(nx-k) \right) \|D_{x-f}^\alpha\|_{\infty, [a, x]} \frac{(x-a)^\alpha}{\alpha} \right\} \stackrel{\text{(by (6), (7))}}{\leq} \\
& \frac{\|D_{x-f}^\alpha\|_{\infty, [a, x]}}{\Gamma(\alpha+1)} \left\{ \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}} + (4.019) \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}} (x-a)^\alpha \right\}. \tag{60}
\end{aligned}$$

Therefore we proved

$$|\theta_{1n}^*(x)| \leq \frac{\|D_{x-f}^\alpha\|_{\infty, [a, x]}}{\Gamma(\alpha+1)} \left\{ \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}} + \frac{2.0095}{\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}} (x-a)^\alpha \right\}. \tag{61}$$

But for large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we get

$$|\theta_{1n}^*(x)| \leq \frac{2 \|D_{x-f}^\alpha\|_{\infty, [a, x]}}{\Gamma(\alpha+1) n^{\alpha\beta}}. \tag{62}$$

Similarly we have

$$\begin{aligned}
\gamma_{2k} & := \left| \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} D_{*x}^\alpha f(J) dJ \right| \leq \\
& \int_x^{\frac{k}{n}} \left( \frac{k}{n} - J \right)^{\alpha-1} |D_{*x}^\alpha f(J)| dJ \leq \\
& \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \frac{\left( \frac{k}{n} - x \right)^\alpha}{\alpha} \leq \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \frac{(b-x)^\alpha}{\alpha}. \tag{63}
\end{aligned}$$

That is

$$\gamma_{2k} \leq \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \frac{(b-x)^\alpha}{\alpha}, \tag{64}$$

for  $k = \lfloor nx \rfloor + 1, \dots, \lfloor nb \rfloor$ .

Also we have in case of  $|\frac{k}{n} - x| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}$  that

$$\gamma_{2k} \leq \frac{\|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]}}{\alpha n^{\alpha\beta}}. \quad (65)$$

Consequently it holds

$$\begin{aligned} |\theta_{2n}^*(x)| &\leq \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left( \frac{\sum_{k=\lfloor nx \rfloor + 1}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} \gamma_{2k} \right) = \\ &\frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \left\{ \left( \frac{\sum_{\substack{k = \lfloor nx \rfloor + 1 \\ |\frac{k}{n} - x| \leq \frac{1}{n^\beta}}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k)}{W(x)} \right) \frac{\|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]}}{\alpha n^{\alpha\beta}} + \right. \\ &\left. \frac{1}{W(x)} \left( \sum_{\substack{k = \lfloor nx \rfloor + 1 \\ |\frac{k}{n} - x| > \frac{1}{n^\beta}}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} \chi(nx - k) \right) \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \frac{(b-x)^\alpha}{\alpha} \right\} \leq \\ &\frac{\|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]}}{\Gamma(\alpha + 1)} \left\{ \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}} + \frac{2.0095}{\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta} - 2)^2}} (b-x)^\alpha \right\}. \quad (66) \end{aligned}$$

That is

$$|\theta_{2n}^*(x)| \leq \frac{\|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]}}{\Gamma(\alpha + 1)} \left\{ \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}} + \frac{2.0095}{\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta} - 2)^2}} (b-x)^\alpha \right\}. \quad (67)$$

But for large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we get

$$|\theta_{2n}^*(x)| \leq \frac{2 \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]}}{\Gamma(\alpha + 1) n^{\alpha\beta}}. \quad (68)$$

Since  $\|D_{x-}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [a, x]}, \|D_{*x}^\alpha f\|_{\infty, [x, b]} \leq M$ ,  $M > 0$ , we derive

$$|\theta_n^*(x)| \leq |\theta_{1n}^*(x)| + |\theta_{2n}^*(x)| \stackrel{\text{(by (62), (68))}}{\leq} \frac{4M}{\Gamma(\alpha + 1) n^{\alpha\beta}}. \quad (69)$$

That is for large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we get

$$|\theta(x)| = |\theta_n^*(x)| \leq \left( \frac{4M}{\Gamma(\alpha + 1)} \right) \left( \frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}} \right), \quad (70)$$

resulting to

$$|\theta(x)| = O\left(\frac{1}{n^{\alpha\beta}}\right), \quad (71)$$

and

$$|\theta(x)| = o(1). \quad (72)$$

And, letting  $0 < \varepsilon \leq \alpha$ , we derive

$$\frac{|\theta(x)|}{\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(\alpha-\varepsilon)}}\right)} \leq \left(\frac{4M}{\Gamma(\alpha+1)}\right) \left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta\varepsilon}}\right) \rightarrow 0, \quad (73)$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .

I.e.

$$|\theta(x)| = o\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(\alpha-\varepsilon)}}\right), \quad (74)$$

proving the claim. ■

We present our second main result which is a multivariate one.

**Theorem 17** *Let  $0 < \beta < 1$ ,  $x \in \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i]$ ,  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  large enough and  $n^{1-\beta} \geq 3$ ,  $f \in AC^m\left(\prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i]\right)$ ,  $m, N \in \mathbb{N}$ . Assume further that  $\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} < \infty$ . Then*

$$H_n(f, x) - f(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{m-1} \left( \sum_{|\alpha|=j} \left( \frac{f_\alpha(x)}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) H_n \left( \prod_{i=1}^N (\cdot - x_i)^{\alpha_i}, x \right) \right) + o\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(m-\varepsilon)}}\right), \quad (75)$$

where  $0 < \varepsilon \leq m$ .

If  $m = 1$ , the sum in (75) collapses.

The last (75) implies that

$$n^{\beta(m-\varepsilon)} \left[ H_n(f, x) - f(x) - \sum_{j=1}^{m-1} \left( \sum_{|\alpha|=j} \left( \frac{f_\alpha(x)}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) H_n \left( \prod_{i=1}^N (\cdot - x_i)^{\alpha_i}, x \right) \right) \right] \quad (76)$$

$$\rightarrow 0, \quad \text{as } n \rightarrow \infty, \quad 0 < \varepsilon \leq m.$$

When  $m = 1$ , or  $f_\alpha(x) = 0$ , for  $|\alpha| = j$ ,  $j = 1, \dots, m-1$ , then we derive that

$$n^{\beta(m-\varepsilon)} [H_n(f, x) - f(x)] \rightarrow 0,$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ ,  $0 < \varepsilon \leq m$ .

**Proof.** Consider  $g_z(t) := f(x_0 + t(z - x_0))$ ,  $t \geq 0$ ;  $x_0, z \in \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i]$ . Then

$$g_z^{(j)}(t) = \left[ \left( \sum_{i=1}^N (z_i - x_{0i}) \frac{\partial}{\partial x_i} \right)^j f \right] (x_{01} + t(z_1 - x_{01}), \dots, x_{0N} + t(z_N - x_{0N})), \quad (77)$$

for all  $j = 0, 1, \dots, m$ .

By (33) we have the multivariate Taylor's formula

$$f(z_1, \dots, z_N) = g_z(1) = \sum_{j=0}^{m-1} \frac{g_z^{(j)}(0)}{j!} + \frac{1}{(m-1)!} \int_0^1 (1-\theta)^{m-1} g_z^{(m)}(\theta) d\theta. \quad (78)$$

Notice  $g_z(0) = f(x_0)$ . Also for  $j = 0, 1, \dots, m-1$ , we have

$$g_z^{(j)}(0) = \sum_{\substack{\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N), \alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+, \\ i=1, \dots, N, |\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = j}} \left( \frac{j!}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N (z_i - x_{0i})^{\alpha_i} \right) f_\alpha(x_0). \quad (79)$$

Furthermore

$$g_z^{(m)}(\theta) = \sum_{\substack{\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N), \alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+, \\ i=1, \dots, N, |\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = m}} \left( \frac{m!}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N (z_i - x_{0i})^{\alpha_i} \right) f_\alpha(x_0 + \theta(z - x_0)), \quad (80)$$

$0 \leq \theta \leq 1$ .

So we treat  $f \in AC^m \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$  with  $\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} < \infty$ .

Thus, by (78) we have for  $\frac{k}{n}, x \in \left( \prod_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i] \right)$  that

$$f\left(\frac{k_1}{n}, \dots, \frac{k_N}{n}\right) - f(x) = \sum_{j=1}^{m-1} \sum_{\substack{\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N), \alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+, \\ i=1, \dots, N, |\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = j}} \left( \frac{1}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \left( \frac{k_i}{n} - x_i \right)^{\alpha_i} \right) f_\alpha(x) + R, \quad (81)$$

where

$$R := m \int_0^1 (1-\theta)^{m-1} \sum_{\substack{\alpha := (\alpha_1, \dots, \alpha_N), \alpha_i \in \mathbb{Z}^+, \\ i=1, \dots, N, |\alpha| := \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_i = m}} \left( \frac{1}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \left( \frac{k_i}{n} - x_i \right)^{\alpha_i} \right) f_\alpha\left(x + \theta\left(\frac{k}{n} - x\right)\right) d\theta. \quad (82)$$

By (39) we obtain

$$|R| \leq \frac{\left( \|x - \frac{k}{n}\|_{l_1} \right)^m}{m!} \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty, m}^{\max}. \quad (83)$$



Notice here that

$$\left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \Leftrightarrow \left| \frac{k_i}{n} - x_i \right| \leq \frac{1}{n^{\beta}}, \quad i = 1, \dots, N. \quad (84)$$

So, if  $\left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{1}{n^{\beta}}$  we get that  $\left\| x - \frac{k}{n} \right\|_{l_1} \leq \frac{N}{n^{\beta}}$ , and

$$|R| \leq \frac{N^m}{n^{m\beta} m!} \|f_{\alpha}\|_{\infty, m}^{\max}. \quad (85)$$

Also we see that

$$\left\| x - \frac{k}{n} \right\|_{l_1} = \sum_{i=1}^N \left| x_i - \frac{k_i}{n} \right| \leq \sum_{i=1}^N (b_i - a_i) = \|b - a\|_{l_1},$$

therefore in general it holds

$$|R| \leq \frac{(\|b - a\|_{l_1})^m}{m!} \|f_{\alpha}\|_{\infty, m}^{\max}. \quad (86)$$

Call

$$V(x) := \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k).$$

Hence we have

$$U_n(x) := \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) R}{V(x)} = \quad (87)$$

$$\frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = \lceil na \rceil \\ \left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \end{array} \right\}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) R}{V(x)} + \frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = \lceil na \rceil \\ \left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} > \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \end{array} \right\}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) R}{V(x)}.$$

Consequently we obtain

$$|U_n(x)| \leq \left( \frac{\sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = \lceil na \rceil \\ \left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} \leq \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \end{array} \right\}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k)}{V(x)} \right) \left( \frac{N^m}{n^{m\beta} m!} \|f_{\alpha}\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} \right) +$$

$$\frac{1}{V(x)} \left( \sum_{\left\{ \begin{array}{l} k = \lceil na \rceil \\ \left\| \frac{k}{n} - x \right\|_{\infty} > \frac{1}{n^{\beta}} \end{array} \right\}}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx - k) \right) \frac{(\|b - a\|_{l_1})^m}{m!} \|f_{\alpha}\|_{\infty, m}^{\max} \stackrel{\text{(by (19), (18))}}{\leq}$$

$$\frac{N^m}{n^{m\beta}m!} \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty,m}^{\max} + (4.019)^N \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}} \frac{(\|b-a\|_{l_1})^m}{m!} \|f_\alpha\|_{\infty,m}^{\max}. \quad (88)$$

Therefore we have found

$$|U_n(x)| \leq \frac{\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty,m}^{\max}}{m!} \left\{ \frac{N^m}{n^{m\beta}} + (4.019)^N \frac{1}{2\sqrt{\pi} (n^{1-\beta} - 2) e^{(n^{1-\beta}-2)^2}} (\|b-a\|_{l_1})^m \right\}. \quad (89)$$

For large enough  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  we get

$$|U_n(x)| \leq \left( \frac{2\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty,m}^{\max} N^m}{m!} \right) \left( \frac{1}{n^{m\beta}} \right). \quad (90)$$

That is

$$|U_n(x)| = O\left(\frac{1}{n^{m\beta}}\right), \quad (91)$$

and

$$|U_n(x)| = o(1). \quad (92)$$

And, letting  $0 < \varepsilon \leq m$ , we derive

$$\frac{|U_n(x)|}{\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(m-\varepsilon)}}\right)} \leq \left( \frac{2\|f_\alpha\|_{\infty,m}^{\max} N^m}{m!} \right) \frac{1}{n^{\beta\varepsilon}} \rightarrow 0, \quad (93)$$

as  $n \rightarrow \infty$ .

I.e.

$$|U_n(x)| = o\left(\frac{1}{n^{\beta(m-\varepsilon)}}\right). \quad (94)$$

By (81) we observe that

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} f\left(\frac{k}{n}\right) Z(nx-k)}{V(x)} - f(x) = \\ & \sum_{j=1}^{m-1} \left( \sum_{|\alpha|=j} \left( \frac{f_\alpha(x)}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) \right) \frac{\left( \sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx-k) \left( \prod_{i=1}^N \left( \frac{k_i}{n} - x_i \right)^{\alpha_i} \right) \right)}{V(x)} + \\ & \frac{\sum_{k=\lceil na \rceil}^{\lfloor nb \rfloor} Z(nx-k) R}{V(x)}. \end{aligned} \quad (95)$$

The last says

$$H_n(f, x) - f(x) - \sum_{j=1}^{m-1} \left( \sum_{|\alpha|=j} \left( \frac{f_\alpha(x)}{\prod_{i=1}^N \alpha_i!} \right) H_n \left( \prod_{i=1}^N (\cdot - x_i)^{\alpha_i}, x \right) \right) = U_n(x). \quad (96)$$

The proof of the theorem is complete. ■

## References

- [1] M. Abramowitz, I.A. Stegun, eds., *Handbook of Mathematical Functions with Formulas, Graphs, and Mathematical Tables*, New York, Dover Publications, 1972.
- [2] G.A. Anastassiou, *Rate of convergence of some neural network operators to the unit-univariate case*, J. Math. Anal. Appl. 212 (1997), 237-262.
- [3] G.A. Anastassiou, *Quantitative Approximations*, Chapman&Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, New York, 2001.
- [4] G.A. Anastassiou, *On Right Fractional Calculus*, Chaos, solitons and fractals, 42 (2009), 365-376.
- [5] G.A. Anastassiou, *Fractional Differentiation Inequalities*, Springer, New York, 2009.
- [6] G.A. Anastassiou, *Fractional Korovkin theory*, Chaos, Solitons & Fractals, Vol. 42, No. 4 (2009), 2080-2094.
- [7] G.A. Anastassiou, *Intelligent Systems: Approximation by Artificial Neural Networks*, Intelligent Systems Reference Library, Vol. 19, Springer, Heidelberg, 2011.
- [8] G.A. Anastassiou, *Fractional representation formulae and right fractional inequalities*, Mathematical and Computer Modelling, Vol. 54, no. 11-12 (2011), 3098-3115.
- [9] G.A. Anastassiou, *Advanced Inequalities*, World Scientific Publ. Co., Singapore, New Jersey, 2011.
- [10] G.A. Anastassiou, *Univariate hyperbolic tangent neural network approximation*, Mathematics and Computer Modelling, 53(2011), 1111-1132.
- [11] G.A. Anastassiou, *Multivariate hyperbolic tangent neural network approximation*, Computers and Mathematics 61(2011), 809-821.
- [12] G.A. Anastassiou, *Multivariate sigmoidal neural network approximation*, Neural Networks 24(2011), 378-386.
- [13] G.A. Anastassiou, *Univariate sigmoidal neural network approximation*, J. of Computational Analysis and Applications, Vol. 14, No. 4, 2012, 659-690.
- [14] G.A. Anastassiou, *Fractional neural network approximation*, Computers and Mathematics with Applications, 64 (2012), 1655-1676.

- [15] G.A. Anastassiou, *Univariate error function based neural network approximation*, submitted, 2014.
- [16] G.A. Anastassiou, *Multivariate error function based neural network approximations*, submitted, 2014.
- [17] L.C. Andrews, *Special Functions of Mathematics for Engineers*, Second edition, Mc Graw-Hill, New York, 1992.
- [18] Z. Chen and F. Cao, *The approximation operators with sigmoidal functions*, Computers and Mathematics with Applications, 58 (2009), 758-765.
- [19] D. Costarelli, R. Spigler, *Approximation results for neural network operators activated by sigmoidal functions*, Neural Networks 44 (2013), 101-106.
- [20] D. Costarelli, R. Spigler, *Multivariate neural network operators with sigmoidal activation functions*, Neural Networks 48 (2013), 72-77.
- [21] K. Diethelm, *The Analysis of Fractional Differential Equations*, Lecture Notes in Mathematics 2004, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Heidelberg, 2010.
- [22] A.M.A. El-Sayed and M. Gaber, *On the finite Caputo and finite Riesz derivatives*, Electronic Journal of Theoretical Physics, Vol. 3, No. 12 (2006), 81-95.
- [23] G.S. Frederico and D.F.M. Torres, *Fractional Optimal Control in the sense of Caputo and the fractional Noether's theorem*, International Mathematical Forum, Vol. 3, No. 10 (2008), 479-493.
- [24] S. Haykin, *Neural Networks: A Comprehensive Foundation* (2 ed.), Prentice Hall, New York, 1998.
- [25] W. McCulloch and W. Pitts, *A logical calculus of the ideas immanent in nervous activity*, Bulletin of Mathematical Biophysics, 7 (1943), 115-133.
- [26] T.M. Mitchell, *Machine Learning*, WCB-McGraw-Hill, New York, 1997.